FOOD POVERTY BEYOND A BAND-AID SOLUTION

1 Dec 2017

Geraldine Chipendo, Tania Loke, Morgan Mohr, Guillaume Paugum, Leonie Westhoff, Ethan Wong

1

Outline

1. What's the problem?

- a. Facts & consequences
- b. Definition
- c. Root causes
- d. Construction

2. How do we solve it?

- a. Typical & good(?) practice
- b. Possible alternatives
- c. An income-based approach

WHAT'S THE PROBLEM?

Facts & consequences Definition Root causes Construction

UK's rising use of food banks re 'unfolding public health crisis', study

New analysis finds clear growth in food bank usage but suggest previous re 'overstated' scale

Alex Matthews-King Health Correspondent | Tuesday 21 November 2017 02-01 GMT | 💭 48 comments

f 💙 🖾 150



In 2014 – the year with the highest food bank use – 1 per cent of adults and 2.3 per cent of children living emergency food *Getty*

The number of people turning to food banks grew by almost 14 per cent in three years, according to a new study which warned of a growing public health crisis from poor nutrition.



K WORLD WEIRD TECH

Food dumped on Downing Street to protest people left in poverty by the Budget

Nicole Morley for Metro.co.uk Tuesday 21 Nov 2017 4:21 pm



The food will later be donated to a food bank (Picture: i-Images)

Tons and tons of food is to be dumped opposite the doorstep of Downing Street to protest against Universal Credit and austerity measures.



fashion food recipes love & sex health & fitness home & garden women family

Fruit

Five-a-day eating targets 'will be unaffordable for millions after Brexit'

Thinktank says consumption of fruit and vegetables could be hit by exchange rates, tariffs and higher labour costs



() Fruit stalls and shops in Govanhill in Glasgow. Currently just 8% of children aged 11-18 eat five portions of fruit and vegetables a day. Photograph: Murdo MacLeod for the Guardian

000-

6,553 1,359

Patrick Butler Social affairs editor Monday 20 November 2017 00.01 GMT

Five-a-day eating targets for fruit and vegetables could become unaffordable for millions of low-income families as a result of Brexit-related food price rises, a report says.

The Food Foundation says that already-feeble consumption rates of healthy food in the UK could nosedive under Brexit because the triple impact of exchange rates, labour costs and tariffs could add up to £158 a year to the amount a family of four spends on fruit and vegetables.

Alternatives

Prevalence rate of food insecurity, 2014



Source: FAO. 2016. Methods for estimating comparable rates of food insecurity experienced by adults throughout the world. Rome, FAO.

Problem definition	Root causes	Construction of the	problem	Typical and good(?) pract	ice /	Alternatives		Solutions	
Proportion of UK households unable to afford food basics			Food necessities		1983	1990	1999	2012	
			Fresh fruit and vegetables		n/a	6%	5%	7%	
unable to	o attora too	(ESRC, 2013) e		ish or vegetarian ent every other day	8%	3%	2%	5%	
			Two me	als a day	4%	1%	(1)%	3%	

- Over three and a half million adults (8%) and well over half a million children (4%) cannot afford to eat properly.
- More than one in four adults (28%) skimped on their own food in 2012 so that others in their households could eat.





Health and food poverty

- 'Among children, both ever being hungry and multiple episodes of hunger were associated with poorer general health but not with chronic conditions or asthma. Higher odds of chronic conditions and of asthma were observed among youth who experienced multiple episodes of hunger compared with those who were never hungry.' (Kirkpatrick, McIntyre, and Potestio, 2010)
- 'Children in food-insecure households had a 4% higher adjusted odds of asthma.' (Mangini et al., 2015)
- Persistent food insecurity is associated with internalising and externalising problems [among children], even after adjusting for sustained poverty and other potential confounders.' (Slopen et al., 2010)

Mental health and food poverty

- 'The relationship between household food insufficiency and respondents' meeting the diagnostic screening criteria for major depression remained highly significant even when controlling for factors known to confer increased risk of depression and time invariant unobserved heterogeneity.' (Heflin, Siefert, and Williams, 2005)
- 'Overall, we find significant negative developmental effects for children with food insecurity at home; and that children experiencing an early transition from food insecurity in 1st grade to food security in 3rd grade have even larger impairments that persist through 5th grade.' (Howard, 2010)
- 'Food insecurity is associated with a wide range of adolescent mental disorders independently of other aspects of SES.' (McLaughlin et al., 2012)

 Root causes
 Construction of the problem
 Typical and good(?) practice
 Alternatives

Problem definition

Low-income households in the UK are increasingly unable to access or afford adequate nutritious food in socially acceptable ways.





* This shows data from 1 April to 5 May 2016 when it stopped being recorded as a main crisis cause

The construction of "food poverty"



HOW DO WE SOLVE IT?

Typical & good(?) practice Possible alternatives An income-based approach

Case study: The US Federal Food Stamp Programme

 The Federal Food Stamp programme (now known as the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Programme) is a federal means-tested programme that provides benefits and food for eligible low-income families.



- President Kennedy's 1st Executive Order called for expanded food distribution, and in 1961, he announced the introduction of the FSP.
- As the major safety net in the US, the FSP is available to all family types (most other programmes are targeted at children, the elderly, etc.). It is the largest US cash-based means-tested transfer programme, with a spending of \$70.9 billion in 2016.
- Most households are inframarginal. Hence, the FSP can be treated as an income transfer (Hoynes and Schanzenbach, 2009).

Alternatives

Effectiveness of the FSP (1/2)

- Using data from the Survey of Income and Program Participation (SIPP), Ratcliffe, Mckernan and Zhang (2011) adopt an instrumental variable model to study the effectiveness of the FSP in reducing food insecurity. Their results show that receipt of the benefits reduces the likelihood of suffering from food poverty by 30%, and reduces the likelihood of being very food insecure by 20%.
- Nord (2011) notes that the programme runs into a self-selection bias, as the programme generally attracts more food-insecure participants into the programme more than offsetting the improvement in food security due to participation. To account for this, he uses a logistic regression model. His results show that the ameliorative effect of SNAP on very low food security is in the range of 20%–50%.

Alternatives

Effectiveness of the FSP (2/2)

- The programme also promotes healthy eating. In 2014, the USDA, acting under the Food Insecurity Nutrition Incentive, granted \$30mil to different programmes across the country to help get healthy food for FSP recipients. Thus they can get subsidies to purchase products at farmer's markets (a huge step forward).
- According to the Coalition Against Hunger, a New York-based non-profit organisation, the adoption of the programme seems to stimulate the economy. They suggest that every \$1 spent in food assistance stimulates the economy by adding \$1.70 into economic activity.

Drawbacks of the FSP

- A major problem is the stigma attached to receiving the benefit. Recipients are sometimes labelled as lazy and having a poor work ethic. In her article, Gezinski (2011), an assistant professor at the University of Utah, indicates that the stigma shames many people into trying to hide their SNAP benefits or not applying to see if they qualify.
- Another problem is associated with **fraud**. According to Rosenbaum (2013), the USDA has cut "trafficking" (the sale of SNAP benefits for cash, which violates federal law) by three-quarters over the past 15 years. SNAP now comes in the form of an electronic debit card, like the ATM cards that most Americans carry in their wallets, which recipients can use in the supermarket checkout line only to purchase food.

Charitable provision

Increasing provision by charitable organisations in the UK, e.g. Trussell Trust foodbanks: 568,907 three day emergency food supplies given to individuals in need by the Trussell Trust between April and September 2017, 208,956 of which were given to children. (Trussell Trust, 2017)



Charitable provision



- Multiple issues with reliance on charitable provision:
 - Alternative so socially accepted forms of food provision—does not solve the issue of food poverty as social exclusion (Lambie-Mumford et al., 2014).
 - Issues related to access—families do not know how it works or do not have access close to where they live (Lambie-Mumford, 2015).
 - Households only turn to food banks when they have no alternatives left (stigma) (Lambie-Mumford *et al.*, 2014).
 - Does not address the **underlying causes** of food poverty (Cooper and Dumpleton, 2013).
 - Minimises the role of the state in alleviating food poverty (Wilde, 2011). $oldsymbol{\circ}$
- Important for emergency provision and possible advocacy role, but not a viable policy solution.

Information-based approaches



- Food seen as **individualist, not related to the broader issue of poverty**; assumption that people do not know how to eat properly (Dowler, 2002).
 - Solution: Provide individuals with information on how to cook/eat.
- Dietary knowledge has been identified as a **predictive factor for healthy eating**, and is strongly correlated with socioeconomic status and education (FSA Ireland, 2015).
- However, skills-based interventions generally have only small (though positive) effects (Worsley, 2002; Wrieden *et al.*, 2007).
 - Ignores the **structural causes** of poverty (Dowler, 2002).
 - Individuals do not have sufficient incomes to be able to support an adequate diet, especially in context of recent cuts to social security, strict sanctions regimes and austerity, as well as significant increases in food prices (Child Poverty Action Group, 2014; Oxfam, 2014; Wilde, 2011).

Solutions

An income-based approach

1. Raise awareness

2. Boost incomes by raising the **minimum wage**

3. Tackle "poverty premium" costs, e.g. housing

4. Reform and expand Universal Credit

Awareness | Minimum wage | Poverty premium | Universal Credit

Alternatives

Recognise the problem... as a problem

- Establish a legal framework forcing the publication of a strategy and progress on an annual basis by the government.
- Collect **data** and monitor changes, under a **centralised** agency rather than dispersed across different departments (Chilton, 2009).
- Set up a parliamentary **commission** holding the government accountable.
- The example of child poverty under New Labour is useful (Joyce, 2014; Child Poverty Commission, 2014; Kennedy, 2014).

Enablers:

Relatively low cost. Lack of organised opposition lobbies.

Constraints:

Lack of political interest. Rejection of bureaucracy and welfare dependency.

Limitation:

Does not ensure any concrete results.

Problem definition Root cause		Root causes	s Construction of the problem	Typical and good(?) practice	Alternatives	Solutions		
	Source: <u>https://www.livingw</u>	mum wage Poverty pre	ge Poverty premium Universal Credit					
Ua	Calculation: https://www.livingwage.org.uk/sites/default/files/Living-wage-calculations%5B1%5D_0_0.pdf							
			THE MINIMUM WAGE Government minimum	NATIONAL LIVING WAGE	LIVI	REAL LIVING WAGE The only wage rate based on		
			for under 25s	for over 25s		what people need to live		
		WHAT IS IT?	£7.05	£7.50		£8.75 across the UK and $£10.20$ in London		
		IS IT THE LAW?	Statutory	Statutory		Voluntary		
	WHAT AGE GROUI	P IS COVERED?	21 and older	25 and older	2	18 and older		
	HOW IS IT SET?		Negotiated settlement based on recommendations from businesses and trade unions	A % of medium earnings, current at 55%, it aims to reach 60% of median earnings by 2020.	f cost of living	made according to the g, based on a basket of I goods and services		
	IS THERE A LONDOR	N WEIGHTING?	No London Weighting	No London Weighting	Yes - Separate	higher rate for London		

- Move away from a low-skill, low-paid, insecure jobs economy and stagnating wages.
- Form an advocacy coalition with similarly interested groups.

Problem definition Roc		ot causes Construction of the problem		Турі	cal and good(?) practice	Alternatives	Solutions	
Premiums experienced by low-income households					Awareness Minimum wage Poverty premium Universal Credit			
(income under 70% of median income)								
Premium type		Exa	mples of premiums (£ per year)		Number of low-income incurring this type of p			
Use of prepayment	meters (PPM)	PPM for electr	ric (£35) or gas (£35)		2.6m (33%)		
Non-standar m	d billing nethods	Paying conten	bill on receipt (£38) ts insurance monthly (£9) urance monthly (£81)		3.9m (50%)		
Not s	witched	Not switched	energy provider (£317)		5.8m (73%)		
Раре	er billing	•	electric or gas (£5) andline/broadband/mobile (£2	23)	3.9m (49%)	Ň " Ň	
Area-based pre	emiums		in a deprived area (£74) essing good value shops (£266))	5.8m (73%		FORDABLE	
Insurance for s	specific items		individual appliances (£132) insurance (£60)		1.8m (23%		HOUSING	
Access to	money	Fee charging A Cheque cashir	ATMs (£25) ng services (£30)		2.3m (29%)		
Higher-cos	st credit	Payday loan (£ Doorstep / ho Rent-to-own (£	me collected credit (£540)		1.3m (16%)		
Source: Joseph Rowntree Found	ation Universit	ty of Bristol and Hous	seholds Below Average Income 2014/15					

Source: Joseph Rowntree Foundation, University of Bristol and Households Below Average Income 2014/15, https://www.jrf.org.uk/blog/acting-unfair-poverty-premiums-must-be-2017-priority, http://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/CBP-7747 Problem definition

Solutions



Awareness | Minimum wage | Poverty premium | Universal Credit

Alternatives

Reform and expand Universal Credit

- "Improve the taper."
- Monitor and improve incomes for families with children.
- Increase the housing provision.
- working-age general, all In benefits frozen, are disproportionately affecting poor households-need to end this.

Conclusion

- Food poverty is a complex, multifaceted problem involving many stakeholders (government, victims, employers, retailers, NGOs, etc.) with various interests.
- Charitable provision is a band-aid solution. We need a comprehensive income-based approach to tackle the root causes upstream.
- Despite clear budgetary constraints within a context of austerity, investing in low-income families' food security will yield long-term socioeconomic and health outcomes that are beneficial not only for individuals but also for society at large.

References (1/5)

All-Party Parliamentary Inquiry (2014), "Feeding Britain: A strategy for zero hunger in England, Wales, Scotland and NorthernIreland", Available at: https://foodpovertyinquiry.files.wordpress.com/2014/12/food-poverty-feeding-britain-final.pdf.

Brewer, M., Clark T., and Goodman, A. (2002), "The Government's Child Poverty Target: How Much Progress has been Made?" [online], London, Institute for Fiscal Studies, Available at: <u>https://www.ifs.org.uk/comms/comm88.pdf</u>.

Brewer, M., Browne, J., Joyce, R., and Sibieta, L. (2010), "Child Poverty in the UK since 1998-99: lessons from the past decade" [online], *Institute for Fiscal Studies Working Paper 10/23*, Available at: <u>https://www.ifs.org.uk/wps/wp1023.pdf</u>.

Child Poverty Action Group (2014), "All-Parliamentary Inquiry into Hunger and Food Poverty in Britain: CPAG's Response" [online], Available at:

http://www.cpag.org.uk/sites/default/files/CPAG%20submission%20hunger%20and%20food%20poverty%20inquiry%20June%20201 4.pdf.

Chilton, M. (2009), "A Rights-Based Approach to Food Insecurity in the United States", *American Journal of Public Health*, 99(7): 1203-1211.

Cooper, N. and Dumpleton, S. (2013), "Walking the Breadline: The Scandal of Food Poverty in 21st Century Britain" [online], Available at: <u>https://policy-practice.oxfam.org.uk/publications/walking-the-breadline-the-scandal-of-food-poverty-in-21st-century-britain-292978</u>.

Dowler, E. (2001), "Inequalities in diet and physical activity in Europe", *Public Health Nutrition*, 4(2B): 701-709.

References (2/5)

Dowler, E. (2002), "Food Poverty in Britain: Rights and Responsibilities", *Social Policy Administration*, 36(6): 698-717.

Dowler, E. (2010), "Income needed to achieve a minimum standard of living" [online], *BMJ* 341: c3070, Available at: <u>http://www.bmj.com/content/341/bmj.c4070</u>.

Dowler, E. (2012), "Rights based approaches to addressing food poverty and food insecurity in Ireland and UK", *Social Science & Medicine*, 74(1): 44-51.

ESRC (2013), "The Impoverishment of the UK: PSE UK first results: Living Standards" [online], Available at: <u>http://www.poverty.ac.uk/pse-research/pseuk-reports</u>.

FAO (2016), "Methods for estimating comparable rates of food insecurity experienced by adults throughout the world", Rome, FAO. Food Standards Agency Northern Ireland (2015), "Understanding Food in the Context of Poverty, Economic Insecurity and Social Inclusion" [online], Available at: <u>https://www.food.gov.uk/sites/default/files/FS307008%20-</u> <u>%20Food%20Poverty%20Final%20Report.pdf</u>.

Gezinski, L. (2011), "The Stigma of Food Stamps" [online], Available at: <u>http://redthread.utah.edu/the-stigma-of-food-stamps/6627</u>.

Hoynes, H.W. and Schanzenbach, D.W. (2009), "Consumption responses to in-kind transfers: Evidence from the introduction of the food stamp program", *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 1(4): 109-139.

Howard, L.L. (2011), "Does food insecurity at home affect non-cognitive performance at school? A longitudinal analysis of elementary student classroom behaviour". *Economics of Education Review*, 30(1): 157-176. Food Poverty | 1 Dec 2017 | 30

References (3/5)

Joyce, R. (2014), "Child Poverty in Britain: recent trends and future prospects" [online], *Institute for Fiscal Studies Working Paper W15/07*, Available at: <u>https://www.ifs.org.uk/publications/7584</u>.

Joyce, R. and Levell, P. (2011), "The impact in 2012-13 of the change to indexation policy" [online], *Institute for Fiscal Studies Briefing Note BN120*, Available at: <u>https://www.ifs.org.uk/publications/5713</u>.

Joyce, R. and Sibieta, L. (2013), "Labour's record on poverty and inequality" [online], Institute for Fiscal Studies Observations, Available at: <u>https://www.ifs.org.uk/publications/6738</u>.

Kerridge, K. (2017), "There's a food poverty crisis in the UK. And the government is starved of ideas" [online], *The Guardian*, Available at: <u>https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2017/mar/31/food-poverty-crisis-government-cost-of-living</u>.

Kennedy, S. (2014), "Child Poverty Act 2010, a Short Guide", Commons Briefing Papers.

Kirkpatrick, S.I., McIntyre, L. and Potestio, M.L. (2010), "Child Hunger and Long-term Adverse Consequences for Health", Archives of *Pediatrics & Adolescent Medicine*, 164(8): 754-762.

Korpi, W. and Palme, J. (1998), "The Paradox of Redistribution and Strategies of Equality: Welfare State Institutions, Inequality, and Poverty in the Western Countries", *American Sociological Review*, 63(5): 661-687.

Lambie-Mumford, H., Crossley, H., Jensen, D., Verbeke, M. and Dowler, E. (2014), "Household Food Security in the UK: A Review of Food Aid" [online], Available at: <u>https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/283071/household-food-security-uk-140219.pdf</u>.

References (4/5)

Lambie-Mumford, H. (2015), "Addressing Food Poverty in the UK: Charity, Rights and Welfare" [online], SPERI Paper No. 18, Available at: <u>http://speri.dept.shef.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/SPERI-Paper-18-food-poverty-in-the-UK.pdf</u>.

Living Wage Foundation (2017), "What is the Real Living Wage?" [online], Available at: <u>https://www.livingwage.org.uk/what-real-living-wage</u>.

Mangini, L.D., Hayward, M.D., Dong, Y.Q., and Forman, M.R. (2015), "Household Food Insecurity Is Associated with Childhood Asthma", *The Journal of Nutrition*, 145(12): 2756-2764.

McLaughlin, K.A. *et al.* (2012), "Food Insecurity and Mental Disorders in a National Sample of U.S. Adolescents", *Journal of the American Academy of Child & Adolescent Psychiatry*, 51(12): 1293-1303.

Nord, M. (2012), "How much does the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program alleviate food insecurity? Evidence from recent programme leavers", *Public Health Nutrition*, 15(5): 811-817.

Office for National Statistics (2017), "Family spending in the UK: financial year ending March 2016" [online], Available at: https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/personalandhouseholdfinances/expenditure/bulletins/familyspendingintheuk/financialyearendingmarch2016.

Ratcliffe, C., McKernan, S.M. and Zhang, S. (2011), "How much does the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program reduce food insecurity?", *American Journal of Agricultural Economics*, 93(4): 1082-1098.

References (5/5)

Rosenbaum, D. (2013), "SNAP is Effective and Efficient" [online], Center on Budget and Policy Priorities, Available at: <u>https://www.cbpp.org/sites/default/files/atoms/files/7-23-10fa.pdf</u>.

Slopen, N., Fitzmaurice, G., Williams, D.R. and Gilman, S.E. (2010), "Poverty, Food Insecurity, and the Behavior for Childhood Internalizing and Externalizing Disorders", *Journal of the American Academy of Child & Adolescent Psychiatry*, 49(5): 444-452.

Social Mobility & Child Poverty Commission (2014), "State of the Nation 2014: Social Mobility and Child Poverty in Great-Britain" [online], Available at: <u>https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/state-of-the-nation-2014-report</u>.

Trussell Trust (2017), "Foodbank Demand Soars Across the UK" [online], Available at: https://www.trusselltrust.org/2017/11/07/foodbank-demand-soars-across-uk/.

Wilde, P. (2011), "Food Security Policy in Developed Countries", in J. L. Lusk, J. Roosen and J. F. Shogren (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of the Economics of Food Consumption and Policy*, Oxford, Oxford University Press.

Wrieden, W. L., Anderson, A. L., Longbottom, P. J., Valentine, K. (2007), "The impact of a community-based cooking skills intervention on cooking confidence, food preparation methods and dietary choices – an exploratory trial", *Public Health Nutrition*, 10(3): 203-211.

Worsley, A. (2002), "Nutrition knowledge and food consumption: can nutrition knowledge change food behaviour?" *Asia Pacific Journal of Clinical Nutrition*, 11(3): 579-585.